

## INDIA

### Punjab State Road Sector Project (Loan 4843-IN) 13<sup>th</sup> Implementation Support Mission (April 6 to 11, 2014) Aide-Memoire

#### I. INTRODUCTION

1. A World Bank team<sup>1</sup> visited the State of Punjab from April 6 to 11, 2014, to review the implementation progress of the Punjab State Road Sector Project (PSRSP). The team conducted site visits of the upgrading package (UG1); the Output and Performance Based Road Contract (OPRC) and held discussions with the officials of Punjab Roads & Bridges Development Board (PRBDB) and Public Works Departments (PWD), Government of Punjab (GOP). The mission also held discussions with contractors and various consultants, engaged under the project.

2. A wrap-up meeting was held and chaired by the Chief Secretary, PWD, GOP, on April 11, 2014. This aide-memoire summarizes the findings, recommendations and agreements reached during the mission. The mission thanks GOP for their support and cooperation extended during the mission. The status of action agreed during the last mission and key actions agreed during this mission to address current implementation issues identified by the mission are shown in **Annex 1** and **2** respectively

#### II. KEY PROJECT DATA & PERFORMANCE RATING

3. This project was approved by the World Bank Board of Directors on December 5, 2006. The Loan and Project Agreements were signed on February 26, 2007 and the loan was made effective on April 2, 2007. The project also underwent restructuring during which the loan closing date was extended for a period of 5 years upto June 5, 2017. The following table summarizes the key project data and updated project performances at this mission.

Key Project Data		Current Ratings and Flags	
Board Date	Dec. 05, 2006	Development Objectives	<b>Satisfactory</b>
Original Closing Date	June.05, 2012	Implementation Progress	<b>Moderately Satisfactory</b>
Revised Closing Date	June 5, 2017	Problem Flags	<b>Safeguards (Environment)</b>
Project Age	88 months		
% Disbursed	US\$ 167.06m (67%)		

#### III. SUMMARY OFFINDINGS, DISCUSSIONS AND AGREEMENTS

4. **Achievement of Project Development Objective (PDO):** The project's overall development objective is to improve operating conditions of State roads for road users, in a sustainable way, thus helping to provide the business enabling environment necessary to support Punjab's economic

---

<sup>1</sup> Consisting of Rajesh Rohatgi (Team Leader/Sr. Transport Specialist); Venkat Rao Bayana (Consultant - Social Development Specialist); Neha Vyas (Sr. Environmental Specialist); Pradeep Valsangkar (Consultant - IT Specialist); Tripti Chopra (Financial Management Specialist), Samuel Haile Selassie (Sr. Procurement Specialist) and N. S. Srinivas (Operations Analyst).

development strategy. The result monitoring (refer to Annex 3) indicates that most of the outcome indicators are likely to achieve target values. The achievement of PDO is therefore rated as Satisfactory.

### **Road Upgrading, Rehabilitation and Maintenance Component**

5. **Phase-I Civil Works Progress:** All works, envisaged under the Phase I of the project has been completed. However on Upgrading works, weak monitoring and non-involvement of Nodal Environment and Social Officers on part of PRBDB has led to a situation where two upgrading works, UG/1 and UG/2 had been closed without proper clean-up/rehabilitation of worksites. This issue has been raised with PRBDB/PWD on several occasions in the last two years and has also been flagged in the aide memoirs of the previous missions.

6. Since the last mission (November 2013), the PRBDB has shared with the Bank within the agreed timeline the closure report pertaining to EMP implementation for UG/1. The report has been reviewed by the Bank and the mission during this visit checked the relevant documentation available at the PRBDB office. Other than the issues related to pucca drains constructed between km 0 to 9+300 on both sides (such as missing drain covers; level differences; improper inlets and non-removal of construction debris), which were not explicitly mentioned in the report, the report is in order. The Project Director, PRBDB confirmed to the mission that outstanding activities pertaining to the drains have been included as part of the Structural Adequacy Works for which bids have been invited.

7. However, the site clean-up and rehabilitation (including that pertaining to drains) on UG/2 remains pending even now. As a result, the preparation and submission of the closure report on EMP compliance covering aspects such as worksite clean-up; rehabilitation of camp, plant sites and borrow areas; debris re-use and disposal; drainage provisions; materials usage and; site enhancement/s continues to remain pending. The mission expressed serious concern on this delayed action. The mission reiterated that the outstanding activities related to site clean-up and rehabilitation (including that pertaining to drainage) need to be completed satisfactorily and at the earliest. It has been agreed that the PRBDB will share with the Bank a note within one week covering the list of outstanding work on the said contract, reasons for delay and its proposal to resolve and close this issue before May 31, 2014. Non-adherence will lead to further downgrading of the rating on environment management and safeguards as the issue has remained outstanding for a period of nearly two years.

### **8. Phase II Civil Works - Output and Performance Based Road Contract for Improvement, Rehabilitation, Resurfacing & Routine Maintenance Works of Sangrur - Mansa -Bathinda Area.**

8.1 The contract was awarded in December 2012 and the scope of works includes maintaining a network of about 203 km on agreed service levels and performance criteria including improvement and rehabilitation works. The 10 year contract is running in its second year of implementation. The contractor has been fully mobilized. The status of the services included in the OPRC contract is provided in the table below:

SN	Section	Name	Length (Km)	Type	Proposed Treatment
1	S1	Sangrur to sunam	11.30	MDR 21	Rehabilitation
2	S2	Bhavanigarh to Kota Shamir	106.13	SH 12 A	Improvement (Widening)
3	S3	Harsingwah chowk to Mansa	7.40	SH 13	Rehabilitation
4	S4	Mansa to Talwandi Sabo	25.00	ODR 9	Improvement (Widening)
5	S5	Dhanaula to Bhikhi	25.40	MDR 14	Rehabilitation
6	B8	Bhatinda to Talwadi sabo	29.00	SH 17	Rehabilitation
		<b>Total</b>	<b>203.86</b>		

The OPRC work is in its second year of implementation. The status of work for the first two years of implementation is provided below:

**Status of work during the first two years of implementation**

Section	Section Details	Year	Financial Progress Target (INR Cr.)	Financial Progress Achieved (INR Cr.)	Financial Progress (%)
S2	Bhavanigarh to Kota Shamir ( <i>Widening</i> )	Year 1	106.77	94.55	88.6%
S5	Dhanaula to Bhikhi ( <i>Rehabilitation</i> )				
S2	Bhavanigarh to Kota Shamir ( <i>Widening</i> )	Year 2	120.03	7.44	6.2%
S4	Mansa to Talwandi Sabo ( <i>Rehabilitation</i> )				

**8.2 Work Program, Designs and current status of improvement/rehabilitation works**– The work program and designs for year 1 and 2 have been approved by the employer and improvement/rehabilitation works are in progress. The three year rolling work program has also been approved by the Project Manager. The employer engaged Thapar Institute of Engineering and Technology, Patiala, for design reviews. The first year work included improvement of 22.2 km of S2 Road and rehabilitation of 25.34 km of S5 road. The contractor has completed the rehabilitation work of S5 and about 50% (11 km) of the improvement work scheduled on S2. The first year works were scheduled to have been completed by December 2013 but are now expected to be completed until April 30, 2014. The mission suggested PRBDB and contracting entity to prepare an action plan to speed up the works without any compensation. The mission was informed that EOT in this regard has been approved by the employer. This delay could be attributed to seeking forest approvals, contractor’s cash flow issues and lack of regular bitumen supply. Second year work has also been started by the contractor. The second year work includes improvement of 47.59 km (S2 and S4) and rehabilitation of 11.3 km (S1). The scheduled date of completion is December 31, 2014 and the progress is satisfactory.

**8.3 Contract Quality Assurance Management Plan (CQAMP):** The document has been approved by the employer; however the mission found it to be very theoretical and not specific in terms of presenting the current quality assurance system and procedures being adopted by the contractor. As soon as the monitoring consultants comes on board this plan should be reviewed and modified. However the mission was informed that the contractor has a quality assurance team, a laboratory set up and in-house mechanism for conducting the required quality control tests. The mission reviewed some documentation and quality control tests during the mission.

**8.4 Network Performance Monitoring** – The contractor has established a network performance monitoring cell which includes two highway patrol and three mobile maintenance units. Regular Network Performance Self-Assessment and Inspection reports are being prepared by the contractor and audited by the employer for payment purposes. In addition, the contractor is also regularly submitting the monthly progress reports. The mission found network conditions as satisfactory during the visit, except a section of B8, where excessive rutting was observed. It was agreed that the contractor would rectify the same by May 30, 2014.

**8.5 Asset Management System** – The contractor has been collecting the asset inventory manually and recording in paper hard copies. An Asset Management System is yet to be developed by the contractor. The mission noted with concerned, delay in establishing such system by the contractor, which is one of the key requirements of the contract.

**8.6 FWD Data Collection** – the mission also noted with concern that, while FWD data were collected for design purposes, the contractor is yet to purchase the FWD equipment, through which the monitoring

of residual pavement life for pavement works has to be assessed by the contractor and employer for acceptance of works and payment. The mission was informed that the order has been placed for FWD by the contractor.

8.7 **Road Safety measures** – The mission was pleased to note that the engineering measures like lane marking and signs along the entire network has been installed by the contractor. The roadside hazards including trees have also been painted with white paints and retro reflective stickers. As a result, the accident reporting by the contractor indicates a reduction in overall accidents including fatal accidents. The mission was informed that during the first year of the contract 17 fatal accidents were reported on the entire network and during the second year so far only 1 fatal accident has been reported.

8.8 **Network Patrolling and Call center** A toll-free number to receive calls from public related to emergencies such as accidents or any kind of mishaps on the stretch and complaints related to any defects on the road has been set up and advertised along the network. A back-up call center is in place to respond to these calls is in place. Two highway patrols, equipped with GPS are patrolling the entire network. A GPS tracking system is in place at the call center to monitor location of these patrols and divert the calls to the nearest vehicle. The mission suggested that the helpline number display boards need to be increased on the network for more prominence as well as easy access to public.

8.9 Overall the implementation progress of the OPRC work is satisfactory. Until March 31, 2014, the contractor has achieved 14% (INR 93crore) of the financial progress as against planned progress of about 17%. The contractor is targeting to complete another 90 crore of works in second year until December 14.

8.10 **Environment Management** The use of Output and Performance Based Road Contracting system (OPRC) requires the Contracting Entity to undertake screening, conduct impact assessment, formulate the environmental management plan and subsequently undertake its implementation. Based on the observations in the field, the mission pointed out the following areas that require attention:

8.11 The mission noted that since the last mission, the Nodal Environment Officer, PRBDB has made two visits to the OPRC network and observations were recorded. The mission reiterated the need for continued and more active involvement of PRBDB, including improvement of the co-ordination mechanism with the Field Division, Sangrur, on environment management matters. The mission also provided guidance on improving the quality of documentation pertaining to recording of site observations and stressed on the importance of taking appropriate action as per the contract.

8.12 The mission once again reminded that the contracting entity's Environmental Management Plan (EMP) (among other documents) are to be approved in writing by the Employer prior to the commencing of any physical work. Link-specific EMP/s are to be prepared for major interventions such as improvement and widening proposals by using the process elements described comprehensively in the ESMF. Prior to preparing the EMP, screening and EA (as applicable) should be completed. There are gaps in executing this ESMF requirement and the process of preparation, submission and approval is yet to be satisfactorily streamlined.

8.13 Further, there is disconnect between the environment/social documents and the actual designs and civil works program. The mission once again explained at length the requirements regarding this as defined in the OPRC contract. In summary, the preparation of an Environmental Management Plan (EMP) has to be adequate and commensurate to the scale of civil works proposed in the particular year for the specific road-link in question. It was also emphasized that the environment and social management reports/plans will be submitted for the Employer's approval by the Contracting Entity along with the detailed designs and works shall not commence till both engineering and safeguard documents are approved.

8.14 The mission had provided detailed comments for one link (S2) (including screening, EIA and EMP reports) during the last mission based on which reports for all other links were to be revised. During this visit, the mission was informed that the reports for S-2 have been revised by the Contracting Entity and will be submitted to PWD/PRBDB soon for review. The mission reminded that for some links/works, this activity stands delayed.

8.15 While all forest clearance cases are on track, the mission noted some disconnect between the civil works program and the regulatory requirement related to the Wildlife Clearance/NOC required for link S2 (since a small part of the link falls within the 10 kms radius from the sanctuary). Since the last mission, the application for obtaining NOC from the State Wildlife Board has been submitted and the process is underway. The mission reminded that the clearance must be obtained prior to initiation of civil works.

8.16 Prior permission for borrowing earth should be planned in line with the civil works program and actual material requirement.

8.17 The contract requires that findings/suggestions from the public consultation process, including on issues related to drainage, safety and impact on CPRs are taken into account prior to the finalization of the engineering design. The mission noted that in cases meetings were conducted a year back and updates haven't been shared with the local community. There is a need to record the consultation process appropriately (as part of EA/SA reports) and obtain the required consent/s from the Gram Panchayat and other local authorities when certain community property (such as the pond/water body in case of link S-2) are likely to be affected due to an unavoidable design intervention.

8.18 Worksite safety management needs to be improved – specifically issues like (i) worker's safety (including protection from dust); (ii) deficient advance warning signage at work fronts; (iii) fire safety and; (iv) mechanical (vehicle/equipment) safety practices requires attention.

8.19 The mission continues to note that while substantive efforts are made prior to the Bank visit to put the over-all house-keeping in order at the Camp and Plant site at Village Khiyala (including pollution management measures at the plant site, dust control, material stacking/management, waste management, waste water disposal and haul road maintenance), regular house-keeping and enforcement remains weak. Specifically, the following is needed: (1) delineation/safety measures around the electrical poles/line to avoid any accident within the campsite; (2) provision/improvement of storm water drainage; (3) continuous dust suppression (including fine dust from the plant) to avoid impact on crops and workers and; (4) maintenance/hygiene at sanitation facilities.

8.20 The mission reminded that location and thereafter lay-out approval for the new camp and plant site (at village *Khayalan Kalan*) in line with ESMF requirements must be carried out well in time. Attention should be paid to: (1) the permanent treatment/solution for circulation and parking areas to avoid dust generation during vehicle movement; (2) solid waste management (including segregation, re-use and disposal); (3) waste water management; (4) drainage (including storm water runoff and silt flow control into surrounding farmland); (5) storage and handling of hazardous/polluting materials; (6) provision of oil interceptors and; (7) haul road management.

8.21 Clearance of earthen dumps beyond the shoulders (along and between the linear plantation declared as 'protected') to prevent water accumulation on the road. While mission noted that action has been initiated by the Contractor since the issue was flagged in the last mission, there are still large sections where this activity is still pending. All such areas and drainage needs to be attended prior to monsoons.

8.22 Maintenance of drains, which the mission noted has not been carried out.

8.23 Broken delineators at Sunam bridge have been fixed/replaced.

8.24 Pollution monitoring is yet to be carried out.

8.25 The mission noted that the Contracting Entity has the required man-power to handle and manage the various obligations related to environment management under the contract. However, coordination between the various institutional players (such as within the Environment and Social Team and Engineering Unit of the Contractor and that between the Sangrur Division of PWD and PRBDB) requires substantial streamlining.

8.26 Reporting and documentation needs to be streamlined at all levels.

8.27 Despite some non-conformances/weak compliance, so far the Employer has not issued any NCRs. The mission expressed concern and sought appropriate action/s in line with contractual obligations/requirements.

8.28 The mission appreciated the efforts made by the Contracting Entity towards organizing on a quarterly basis Awareness and Training Camps on road safety, HIV/AIDS and occupational health and safety and provided a few suggestions to strengthen its impact. The target groups are primarily the workers and local residents/community.

8.29 The mission also took note and appreciated the re-use of scarified bitumen and excess earth as part of the works/activities under the contract.

8.30 **Social Safeguards:** The social activities related to OPRC roads include (a) finalization of RAP for OPRC roads (b) finalizing and putting in place arrangements for implementing RAP (c) finalizing and preparing appropriate land acquisition plans and limited RAP for land to be taken for geometric improvements in S2 road.

8.31 *Submission of Revised draft RAP:* The revised draft RAP was submitted by the OPRC Contractors in April 2014 to the PRBDB which needs to be reviewed for its compliance to the comments provided during last mission. The PRBDB will review the revised RAP and submit it to the World Bank before April 30, 2014. The quick review suggests that most of the comments suggested were not addressed in the revised RAP submitted during the current mission.

8.32 The suggested changes for the RAP during last mission are as follows: (a) present design changes in S2 road for four laning at few locations (b) re-categorize the NTH into kiosks, encroachers, squatters, etc. based on actual impacts (c) state extent of loss - partial or full (d) reconfirm the budget estimates based on actual eligible entitlements (e) propose appropriate institutional arrangements as RAP to be implemented by OPRC (f) synchronize RAP implementation timelines with civil works schedule.

8.33 The implementation plans and arrangements for Resettlement Action Plan as agreed during last mission is yet to be initiated by the OPRC Contractors and PRBDB. The roads proposed in year two have issues of R&R. The OPRC has now entered into second year of project timeline. It is agreed that PRBDB will initiate measures for implementation of RAP for second year roads before end April 2014.

8.34 The implementation responsibility of the RAP will be with the OPRC Contractor and R&R cost will be funded separately by the PRBDB. The contractor will prepare Micro Plans and submit to the PRBDB for their review and approval. The contractor will assess possibilities for developing vendor market for commercial squatters in collaboration with local Municipality/Gram Panchayat.

8.35 Geometric improvement in S2 road and land requirement – Preparation of RAP and subsequent implementation of R&R actions have not been able to progress for this section of the road as one of the land owners is not ready to part with his land for road works and has approached the court. The PRBDB has been pursuing the land owners with land swapping proposals and other R&R benefits available under the project.

8.36 On S2 road between chainages kms 35.8 and 37.9 kms to improvise existing 'S' curve alignment it has been proposed to straighten the 'S' curve for about 721 mts. This may require about 2.16 hectares of private agriculture land located adjacent to the existing road. PRDB has carried out preliminary consultations with the farmers for transferring the land for road improvement. It has been broadly agreed with the farmers in lieu of transferring their lands, the current existing adjacent road land will be transferred to the farmers and all required assistance and support will be provided in making the existing road land cultivable agriculture land. It has been agreed that PRDB will undertake complete social assessment and prepare and submit a report to the Bank before end July 2014 with all details such as required private land, socio economic profile of the land owners, land improvement cost, time lines, etc.

8.37 *HIV/AIDS Awareness Plans:* The action plan for implementation of HIV/AIDS awareness program as agreed during last mission has not yet been submitted by the Contractor. The mission again reiterates that the Contractor has to duly discharge this social responsibility as per the provisions of the Contract. It is agreed that the Contractor will submit Action Plan to the PRBDB and share with the Bank before May 20, 2014.

8.38 *OPRC Monthly progress reports* – The review of monthly progress reports submitted by the OPRC Contractors presents no details on social aspects. It has been agreed that from now on the reports will provide the details on social aspects in an agreed format.

8.39 **Additional Works on the OPRC Contract:** During the site visit it was noted that there are 8 narrow bridges on the network (which are more than 6m in width), which may become a potential safety hazard, once the network is widened. The widening of these bridges was not envisaged as improvement work in the original scope of works. Similarly, there is a railway crossing, where no ROB was proposed under the original scope. The mission discussed various options of undertaking these works with PRBDB. It was agreed that once the project costs are revised as part of the proposed restructuring and there are savings, PRBDB could submit a proposal in this regard to the Bank for clearance. The mission also suggested PRBDB to initiate dialogue with the railways department regarding ROB. Meanwhile, the mission advised contracting entity to install additional safety signage and retro reflective rumble strips on these 8 narrow bridges.

8.40 **Procurement of Monitoring Consultants (MC) for OPRC contract.** The procurement process for the selection of the consultant is at the final stage. The financial proposal has been opened but negotiation is yet to happen. The Bank expressed concerned on the delay of selection and urged PRBDB to expedite the selection and send the draft negotiated contract for Bank's review by May 15, 2014.

7. *Intervention to provide Structural Adequacy to Kharar-Banur-Tepla (UG1) Corridor:* The contract for this work was signed on March 14, 2014, but the contractor is yet to be mobilized. One of the key deficiencies identified on this stretch is the rutting towards the median on some of the 4-laned portion on the Kharar-Landran section. Excessive rutting has been found on about 15-20% of the 9 km stretch for which no single reason or solution have been identified so far. The mission suggested that one of the solutions could be to reconstruct the section of the road where there was existing road. In line with the environment management requirements agreed for the project and as per the agreement during the last mission, the PRBDB has taken the required actions, including integration of EHS requirements in the contract document. The mission reminded PRBDB that to avoid any unwarranted situation like the closure issue on UG/1 and UG/2, regular supervision and monitoring must be carried out by PRBDB at all stages of the work (including commencement, during execution and prior to works closure and issuing of substantial completion certificate).

8. *Road Safety Enhancement and Black Spot Improvement* The mission noted with concerned extensive delays in finalizing designs and bill of quantities for the works on 138 black spots identified by the consultants. There is a need for consultants to strengthen their team with highway engineering and contract management experts and mobilizing the team locally at Chandigarh. It was agreed that the designs, cost estimates and draft bidding documents would be submitted to the Bank by June 15, 2014

9. *Liquor Shops within RoW of Bank funded Roads:* PRBDB informed that there are no liquor shops within the ROW on the Bank funded roads..

## 10. **Dehlon Bypass**

11. *Designs and Estimates* The mission was informed that the draft DPR, cost estimates and bid documents have been prepared and are being reviewed internally by PRBDB. It was agreed that the DPR along with the cost estimates, drawings and draft bid document will be shared with the Bank by April 30, 2014.

12. *Environment Assessment* The mission met and interacted with the consultants who have carried out the baseline monitoring for the Dehlon by-pass. The proposed by-pass of 2.9 km of 45 meters width at Dehlon under UG/2 requires approximately 38 acres of irrigated agricultural land and would impact two bore wells and one hand pump. The mission was informed that the preparation of the environment assessment report and the EMP is nearing completion. It is now expected that the limited EA report, including the EMP will be shared with the Bank by April 30, 2013 along with the engineering design

document. With regard to the EA, the mission emphasized on the following: (a) consultation process and how the findings have been addressed/incorporated in the design; (b) analysis of alternatives, including the ‘no-project’ scenario; (c) modelling for estimating future pollution loads; and; (d) preparation of a focused and an appropriate EMP/mitigation measures in line with ground realities and design propositions.

13. *Social Assessment:* Land acquisition process has been initiated for the bypass and draft notification under Section 4(1) was issued in December 2013 as per the provisions of the Standard Order 28, GoP. First round of negotiations have been completed for one village (Dehlon) out of two villages. For Rurka village negotiations are yet to be initiated. It has been agreed that all the negotiations will be completed before end June 2014 and rate approval and disbursement of compensation will be completed by end August 2014. The notification details indicate that about 32 acres of irrigated agricultural land (from 139 plots) located in two villages will be purchased as per the provisions of Standing Order 28, issued by Department of Revenue, GoP.

14. The socio economic survey for this bypass was complete and the preparation of draft Resettlement Action Plan (RAP) is under progress. It has been agreed that draft RAP will be submitted to the Bank before end April 2014. Following submission of the draft RAP to the Bank, the same will be disclosed on PRBDB website and at Panchayat offices of the project villages before May 20, 2014.

#### 15. **Other Social Safeguard Issues**

16. *Social Safeguard Monitoring by PMU:* The mission again reiterates that the PRBDB should effectively utilize its in house capacities to guide and monitor social safeguard issues. The mission suggests that the in house experts should make time to time visits to OPRC roads and review the progress reports. The PMU and the Contractor has all the responsibility to ensure the proper implementation of the Project R&R Policy and the Contractor should ensure delivery of all entitlements to the affected population before starting civil works.

17. *Handing over Kiosks:* PRBDB has finalized agreements with lease holders for maintaining of about three bus shelter kiosks built under Phase I. It is in the process of making similar arrangements for other kiosks as well.

18. The overall implementation progress of social safeguards is maintained at *Moderately Satisfactory*.

#### 19. **Procurement**

20. *Overall Procurement Status:* A majority of the contracts under the project have been awarded and only a few contracts remain to be completed. Overall ... contracts have been completed, ... contracts are under implementation, ... contracts are on procurement process and procurement for ... contracts has not been commenced as summarized on table 1 hereafter.

Description	Works		Goods		Consultant Services		Total	
	No.	Value (in crores)	No.	Value (in crores)	No.	Value (in crores)	No.	Value (in crores)
Completed	19	837.01	4	1.25	15	27.66	38	865.92
Under Implementation	2	614.71	0	0	4	9.74	6	624.45
Being Procured	2	155.00	0	0	1	25.38	3	180.38
Not Started	2	20.00	1	0.15	2	7.00	5	27.15
Total	25	1626.72		1.40	22	69.78	52	1697.90

21. *Procurement Plan* It was agreed with the mission that an updated procurement plan incorporating all new packages that are under implementation or planned to be implemented will be prepared and sent to the Bank by April 30, 2014.

22. *Post Procurement Review:* Post Procurement Review of a contract for Consultancy Services for Baseline Environmental Data Collection for EIA report for Dehlon Bypass was conducted. It was noted that the selection was done following single source selection procedures and there are no major issues. The value of the contract is very small INR 2,23,507 (Approximately USD 3,700) hence the use of SSS is justified. However the contract is not included in the procurement plan and the office did not request Banks no objection for the contract and the use of Single Source Selection. The mission advised PRBDB to ensure that the agreed procedures are followed.

23. *Package XVI, Phase II: Consultancy Services for Appointment of Project Consultant for Computerization of Public Works Department (B&R) Punjab* Proposals were invited and pre-proposal conference was conducted for the contract on March 4, 2014. The mission was informed that a significant number of queries in excess of 300 were raised by prospective bidders on technical and procurement issues. In addition it was noted that there is a need to make amendments to the bidding documents. It was agreed that an amended bidding document will be prepared in addition to response to clarification and sent to the Bank for no objection prior to issuance to prospective bidders by May 30, 2014. The amendment shall include: (i) Revising the qualification requirements, (ii) revisiting the staffing schedule and the scores allocated to the Project Manager and other technical requirements.

24. *Consultancy for OPRC Projects (M/s OPUS):* The mission was informed that the final variation to the consultants and other modalities will be settled by June 30, 2014.

25. *BCEOM Payments:* The mission was informed that all the pending payments will be settled by May 31, 2014.

### ***Institutional Strengthening Component***

26. *Consultancy Services for Monitoring and Evaluation of Project Indicators:* A presentation was made by the consultants on the results of end term data collected in the year 2013. The consultants have been collecting speed and vehicle operating cost (VOC) data for the entire network and roughness and road condition data for the improved roads. The data was collected in the year 2011 and 2013 and the data comparison with baseline (2005) indicates that there has been an increase in the average journey speed on the core road network. The mission observed that the weighted average unit VOC for all modes combined also showed consistent declining trend. Given that the project has another 4 years for closing it was agreed that the monitoring indicators under the same categories for the entire network including OPRC network will be collected in 2015 and 2017 through one consultancy to be procured by PRBDB. The draft EOI, TOR and RFP in this regard to be prepared by PRBDB and sent to the Bank by July 31, 2014.

27. *Road User Satisfaction Survey (RUSS):* The present contract with consultants stands complete. However, there is a need to engage consultants for carrying out next RUSS surveys for 2015 and 2017 for which procurement need to commence in 2014. The mission suggested that the PRBDB explore the possibility of procuring one consultant for RUSS and network indicators. The methodology of new surveys needs to be the same as was adopted earlier.

28. *Consultancy for Road Safety Awareness Generation:* The Consultant has carried out a road safety audit on phase 1 and the second round of the awareness campaign is ongoing.

29. *Preparation of GIS Maps for Punjab Roads:* The GIS mapping exercise, which is being undertaken by the PRBDB in-house has been delayed and has so far completed for 7 circles out of 13. It was agreed that the entire network will be completed by August 31, 2014.

30. *Integrated Transport Policy and Strategy and Strategic Investment Plan (Transport Sector Master Plan)*: The mission was informed that the final report has been submitted by the consultants in July 2013 and a meeting of the steering committee has been scheduled on May 14, 2014 for endorsement of the final report.

31. *Integrated Data Evaluation System for Road Accident (IDEAS – Punjab)* A web based accident reporting and analysis system has been prepared under the project, which is a useful tool for PRBDB, Punjab Police, local authorities, pressure groups, academic and research organizations. PRBDB has provided training to police stations of 21 districts, while training in 2 districts are balance. Currently accidents are being recorded and entered by police stations, while the administrative rights of website is with PRBDB. Once training is completed, these rights need to be handed over to Police to maintain the website.

32. *Speed Camera Program* The GoP is in the process of launching statewide speed camera program and have engaged a program management consultants. An Expression of Interest was invited from potential System Integrators for procuring speed cameras and designing its back-end system to analyze images and collect fines on PPP basis but did not result in to award. Meanwhile GOP has requested Bank for Technical Assistance in this regard. The mission held discussions with Traffic Police in this regard and it was agreed that a pilot project may be taken up on one or two state roads rather than a state-wide implementation. The mission requested GOP to identify the pilot roads while simultaneously the Bank would engage specialist / expert for technical support.

33. *Computerization of PWD* Detailed meeting was held with the representatives of PRBDB and their consultants (M/S Wipro) on the 600+ queries raised during the pre-bid conference held for the computerization bid. All the technical queries were discussed and resolutions arrived at in consultation with PRBDB and their consultants. Following important issues require attention during the bid progression at the project:

- **Data Centre:** While the proposed solution is expected to be implemented in the coming year; a firm understanding on which Data Centre and which Disaster Recovery Centre shall be utilized for hosting the ERP has not been put in to place. This is perceived as a risk to successful implementation of the project. It is strongly recommended that data centre and disaster recovery centres be finalized and a firm written agreement be arrived at using this for the purpose of project implementation.
- **DC – DR Connectivity:** Possible medium of communication between DC and DR may also be finalized and arrangements for acquiring the same may be finalized.
- **Network Infrastructure at PwD Offices:** Details of number of offices, network infrastructure inside each of them and bandwidth provisioning at each location may be worked out and clearly annotated in the corrigendum to the bid document.
- **Data Management:** Data management is an important part of the project implementation. While a desire to digitize voluminous data in respect of much older projects is likely to lead to Data Chaos; much less data in regard to projects, HR, Finance and other PwD entities may lead to non-availability of the system to the stakeholders. Thus, judicious decisions on a cut off date and exact data to be utilized for the purpose of making the system go live, needs to be undertaken. PwD is advised to take such a decision in consultation with their consultants.

34. The paragraph on penalties on page 246-247 stipulates a penalty of up to 15% on non-performance of SLA during the O&M phase of the project. A number of bidders have requested to review this percentage. PWD may like to relook at these percentages in light of multiple requests.

35. All the pre-qualifying requirements were reviewed with the project director and the Task team Leader. Decisions taken during this review process may be reflected in the revised bid document.

36. All decisions taken during the day long meeting with PRBDB and their consultants on all the technical points raised during the pre-bid meeting may be reflected in the revised bid document.

37. **Environment Safeguard Management** While the mission continues to recognize that there were several good initiatives/actions and a satisfactory performance on environmental management under the project in the past, the quality of EMP implementation had progressively declined in the last two years. A general neglect and weak monitoring by PRBDB on environment, health and safety dimensions as part of the over-all project monitoring had led to this progressive slippage in performance. For the current mission, the over-all rating on environment management and safeguards in the project continues to be rated as 'moderately unsatisfactory'. Despite clear-cut agreements, some of the activities identified during the earlier mission/s continue to remain pending. Among these, the most critical action pertains to non-completion of site clean-up and rehabilitation work on UG/2. On other outstanding activities, the mission noted that PRBDB has initiated some action/s since the last mission in November 2013. More details are in the sub-sections given below.

38. **Financial Management and Disbursement** The mission reviewed the existing financial management arrangements at the project. The recent developments and key issues are highlighted below.

39. **Planning and Budgeting:** The total expenditure for the project till March 2014 is Rs 980 crore. Against the budgetary provision of Rs 200 crores, the total expenditure made by the project for financial year 2013-14 is Rs 112 crore. Expenditure for financial year 2014-15 is estimated at Rs 200 crore out of which Rs 150 crore is expected eligible expenditure for bank financing. Presently, the State budget for FY 2014-15 is not allocated scheme wise provision due to vote on account budget.

40. **Disbursement** As on April 9, 2014 is USD 167.06 million which represents 67% of the loan of USD 250.00 Million. The project has designated advance of USD 15.71 million. The project is regular in submission of IUFs and claims till quarter ending 18 March 2013 has been cleared by the Bank and claim for December 2013 has been submitted to CAAA for processing. The next IUF for the quarter ending March 2014 (expected expenditure USD 3 million) will be due on May 15, 2014 and the project has agreed to submit the same by April 15, 2014.

41. **Internal Controls:** Bank reconciliation though performed by the Finance manager but it is neither reviewed nor signed off at PRBDB division. It was advised that to make the control more effective, the Assistant Finance Controller should review and sign off monthly bank reconciliation. It was further discussed that an in-house internal audit consultant/ divisional accountant officer will be hired who will perform the function of internal audit. The Bank will provide a checklist which can be customized for the project to carry out the internal audit.

42. **Financial reporting:** Bank discussed format 2 of the IUF and informed that ineligible expenditure recovered by the Bank needs to be deducted from the total expenditure to arrive at the eligible expenditure on which bank financing share is computed. It was agreed that ineligible expenditure recovered by the Bank will be indicated in the IUF as a footnote. Project also agreed that it will address the observations raised during review of IUF i.e. expenditure reported in IUF format 1 and Prior review format 4 are same.

43. **Staffing:** The additional financial controller continues to hold the additional charge of the financial controller. It was discussed with the project that if required the finance department of GoP may be approached to fill the vacant position. However, the project was of the opinion that since major works are only in one division, the additional financial controller is sufficient. It was shared with the project that the finance manager should regularly be making field visit to the various sites under this project. During such visits he may perform various controls such as physical verification, review of accounts of the division, IT back up taken and any other financial management aspect relating to the divisions.

44. **External Audit:** The audit report for FY 2012-13 was submitted to the Bank by letter dated October 11, 2013. In this report AG has held under objection Rs3.07 crore to which the project has sent a reply in letter dated March 31, 2014. Timeline to settle these observations has been extended till the next audit cycle is concluded i.e. September 30, 2014. As of today, excluding financial year 2012-13, audit observation of Rs 48.21 crore are yet to be settled by AG. Out of these audit disallowances, the project has provided AG recertification of approximately Rs 10 crore which is still under review with the Bank. A claim of Rs 2.52 crore (Rs 3.36 crore @ 75%) , already cleared with the Bank, is yet to be submitted to CAAA for processing.

45. **Public Disclosure-** IUFRR till quarter ending December 2013 are uploaded on the PRBDB website. Audited financial statements for financial year 2012-13 are yet to be uploaded on the website.

46. The financial management performance rating is retained at Moderately Satisfactory.

47. **Compliance with Legal Covenants:** Government of Punjab is non-compliant with the legal covenant of transferring the proceeds of the loan to PRBDB within 14 days of receipt of the said proceeds. Funds transferred by GOI to the GoP amounting to Rs 20.8 crore in December 2013 has yet not been received by the project.

48. **The Next Mission:** The next full implementation support mission will be planned in October 2014. However an interim mission would be planned in July/August 2014.

#### IV PROJECT RATINGS

Field	Rating	
	Last Mission	Current Rating
Road Upgrading, Rehabilitation and Maintenance Component	MS	MS
Institutional Strengthening Component	S	S
Environmental Safeguard Management	MU	MU
Social Safeguard Management	MS	MS
Project Management	MS	MS
Financial Management	MS	MS
Procurement quality/timeliness	S	S

HS highly satisfactory, S satisfactory, MS Moderately Satisfactory, MU Moderately Unsatisfactory, U unsatisfactory, NA not applicable.

**Annex-1**

**Status of Action Agreed During the Last Mission**

<b><u>No.</u></b>	<b><u>Key Actions</u></b>	<b><u>Target Date</u></b>	<b><u>Status</u></b>
<b>Civil Works</b>			
1	Submit Technical Evaluation Report of Monitoring Consultants (OPRC)Bids	Jan 7, 2014	Complied with
2	Dehlon Bypass - Submission of Detailed Project Report, Cost Estimates, Drawings, RAP, limited EA report including EMP and Draft Bidding Document	Jan 31, 2014	Pending
3	Accident Black Spot Improvements - Submit draft cost estimates, designs and bidding document	Feb 28, 2014	Pending
4	Intervention to provide structural adequacy to Kharar-Banur-Tepla Corridor - submit revised Cost Estimates, designs and draft bidding documents including EMP	Dec 15, 2013	Complied with
5	Improve Work Site Safety and Traffic Management During Construction on OPRC network	Immediate/Continuous	Complied with
6	Finalize Variation of OPUS and Make final payments to BCEOM	Jan 31, 2014	Pending
<b>Institutional Strengthening Component</b>			
1	Submit Revise Bidding Documents for Computerization	Dec 15, 2013	Complied with delays
2	Advertise for appointing IT Director in PWD	Jan 07, 2014	Pending
3	Endorsement of the final report of the Transport Sector Policy and Strategy and Final Report on Strategic Investment Plan	Jan 31, 2014	Pending
4	Integrated Data Evaluation System for Road Accident (IDEAS – Punjab)- complete training in 3 districts and hand over website rights to Police	Mar 31, 2014	Pending
<b>Environment Safeguards</b>			
1	Sharing of the long pending closure report on EMP compliance for Contracts UG/1 and UG/2 with the Bank	Jan. 15, 2014	Complied with for UG1; Pending for UG/2
2	Ensure completion of clean-up/rehabilitation work (including drains related), particularly on UG/1	Dec. 31, 2013	Drain works included as part of Structural Adequacy Works
3	Ensure proper enforcement of ESMF requirements, monitoring and documentation/record keeping on environment, health and safety aspects in the OPRC works	Continuous / Immediate	Partially Complied and Continuous
5	Obtain all required regulatory clearances (forestry / Wildlife NOC) for OPRC works	As per Works Schedule	In progress
6	Adoption of the Standard Bidding Document by PRBDB/PWD	Partially Completed / Dropped Now.	Partially Complied/ Dropped Now
<b>Social Safeguards</b>			
1	LA for Dehlon bypass - complete declaration of award	Feb 28, 2014	Under progress
2	LA for Dehlon bypass - complete disbursement of compensation for land	Mar 31, 2014	Under progress
3	Submit RAP for Dehlon bypass	Jan 31, 2014	Yet to submit
4	Revise and finalise RAPs for OPRC roads	Dec 20, 2013	Revised RAP submitted in April 2014. Needs to be reviewed.
5	Submit abbreviated/limited RAP for S2 OPRC road for proposed realignment section	Jan 31, 2014	Pending for court judgment for case filed by one of the

			land owners.
6	Handing over Kiosks to either Panchayat / private company	Partially completed/March 31, 2014	Partially completed
<b>Financial Management</b>			
1	Reply to AG for observation of Rs 3.03 crore for FY 12-13	Jan 31,2014	Complied with
2	Train finance staff in OPRC payments	Continuous	-
3	Make field visit at minimum monthly frequency	Continuous	-
4	Reply to AG for observation of Rs 9.04 crore for FY 11-12	Immediate	Complied with

**Action Agreed During the Mission**

<b>No.</b>	<b><u>Key Actions</u></b>	<b><u>By whom</u></b>	<b><u>Target Date</u></b>
<b>Civil Works</b>			
1	OPRC - Install additional safety signages and retro-reflective rumble strips on both sides of the 8 narrow bridges	Contractor	Immediate
2	OPRC - Install additional helpline number sign boards for more dissemination and awareness	Contractor	Immediate.
3	OPRC - Rectify B8 defects	Contractor	Immediate
4	Dehlon Bypass - Submission of Detailed Project Report, Cost Estimates, Drawings, RAP, limited EA report including EMP and Draft Bidding Document	PRBDB	April 30, 2014
5	Accident Black Spot Improvement – Submit designs, cost estimates and draft bidding documents	PRBDB	June 15, 2014
6	Finalize payments to M/s OPUS	PRBDB	June 30, 2014
7	Finalize payments to BCEOM	PRBDB	May 30, 2014
<b>Institutional Strengthening Component</b>			
1	Monitoring and Evaluation of Project Indicators and RUSS – Submit draft EOI, TOR and RFP	PRBDB	July 31, 2014
2	Integrated Data Evaluation System for Road Accident (IDEAS – Punjab)- complete training of balance districts and hand over the system to police	PRBDB	June 30, 2014
3	Appoint IT Director in PWD	PRBDB	July 31, 2014
4	Preparation of GIS Maps for the remaining PWD circles (6)	PRBDB	August 31, 2014
5	GOP to identify pilot roads for speed camera interventions	PRBDB	June 30, 2014
6	Bank to engage specialist / expert for technical support	Bank	July 15, 2014
<b>Environment Safeguards</b>			
1	Undertake and complete site clean-up/rehabilitation work (including drains related) on UG/02	PRBDB	By April 30, 2014
2	Share the closure report on EMP compliance for UG/2 with the Bank	PRBDB	By May 31, 2014
3	Ensure proper enforcement of ESMF requirements, including those pertaining to health and work site safety	PRBDB/PWD	Continuous
4	Submission of reports (Screening/EA/EMP) in line with design proposition/s	Contracting Entity	As per Work Schedule
5	Streamline monitoring, documentation/record keeping on EHS aspects in the OPRC works	PRBDB/PWD	By May 15, 2014
6	Obtain all required regulatory clearances (forestry/wildlife) for works under OPRC	PRBDB/ Contractor	As per Work Schedule
<b>Social Safeguards</b>			
1	Land acquisition for Dehlon bypass - complete declaration of award	PRBDB	June 30, 2014
2	Land acquisition for Dehlon bypass - complete disbursement of compensation for land	PRBDB	August 31, 2014
3	Revise and finalize RAPs for OPRC roads	PRBDB/Contractor	May 15, 2014
4	Submit abbreviated/limited RAP for S2 OPRC road for proposed realignment section	PRBDB/Contractor	June 30, 2014
5	Handing over Kiosks to either Panchayat / private company	PRBDB	July 30, 2014
<b>Financial Management</b>			
1	Compliance to legal covenant of fund transfer within 14 days	GoP	Immediate
2	Strengthen internal controls relating to Bank reconciliation	PRBDB	April 30,2014
3	Engage divisional accountant or a competent person to perform internal audit	PRBDB	June 30, 2015

	function		
4	Finance manager to make field visit at minimum monthly frequency	PRBDB	Continuous
5	Audited financial statements for financial year 2012-13 to be uploaded on PRBDB website.	PRBDB	Immediate
6	Submit IUFR for the quarter ending March 2014	PRBDB	April 15, 2014
<b>Procurement</b>			
	Update and submit the revised procurement plan	PRBDB	April 30, 2014
	Complete negotiation and submit draft negotiated contract of OPRC Monitoring Consultants for Bank review	PRBDB	May 15, 2014
	Submit pre-bid clarification and revised bidding document of the PWD computerization to the Bank	PRBDB	May 30, 2014

### Results Monitoring Indicators

	Target Values				Data Collection and Reporting		
Project Outcome Indicators	Baseline	YR8 (2015)	YR10 (2017)	Current Value (YR6 – 2013)	Frequency and Reports	Data Collection Instruments	Responsibility for Data Collection
Average Network Speed (kmph)	34.2	46	48	43.77	MTR and end-of-implementation PRBDB Report	Surveys	PRBDB
Maintain VOC (%)	9.5%	20%	20%	9.6%	MTR and end-of-implementation PRBDB Report	Surveys	PRBDB
Reduction in number of fatal accidents	2655	2522	2390	1876 (up to July 2013)	Aide memoire, every six months	First Information Reports (FIRs)	Police/ PRBDB/ Bank
Increase in User Satisfaction	61.11%	64%	67%	66.02%	User satisfaction Survey Report, every two year	Survey	PWD/ PRBDB
Improvement in efficiency of Road Agency (PWD, PRBDB)	60.27%	63%	65%	63.60%	User Satisfaction Survey Report, every two year	Survey	PWD/ PRBDB
<b>Results Indicators for Each Component</b>							
<b>Component 1:</b> Total km of roads improved and rehabilitated under the project w.e.f. YR 6	0 km	136km	166km	39.15km-	Monthly Construction Supervision Reports; Quarterly FRMs, Aide Memoire (every 6 months)	Certification of Quantities by the Engineer	Construction Supervision Consultant; PRBDB
Maintain IRI (m/ km)	9.2/km	2.6/ km	2.6/km	2.95/km	PRBDB's Annual Report, Yearly	Roughness and Condition Surveys	PRBDB
Maintain poor and bad network condition@ 4%	67%	4%	4%	7%	PRBDB's Annual Report, yearly	Roughness and Condition Surveys	PRBDB
<b>Component 2:</b> Department wide computerization and use of integrated systems for planning, management, financial accounting, monitoring	-		Final Roll-out to the entire department	Bidding Documents issued	As per implementation schedule	-	PWD/ PRBDB

### Governance and Anti-corruption Action Plan: Implementation Status

#### Disclosure of information

Topics	Documents to be disclosed	Status
<b>Procurement</b>	The overall project Procurement Plan	Uploaded on PRBDB website and updated regularly.
	All bid invitations and related documents (SPN, Expression of Interest, Letter of Interest)	Uploaded on PRBDB website as well as on UNDB online / dgmarket.
	All Contracts awarded for consultancy services and for Rehabilitation, Up-gradation and Maintenance of Roads awarded on ICB/NCB or any other method of procurement.	Since most of the Consultancy and Civil works Agreements stand completed and closed, therefore, the issue may be discussed during next mission.
<b>Financial Management</b>	Project Financing Plans	Uploaded on PRBDB website .
	Budgetary allocation for the project.	Uploaded on PRBDB website.
	Expenditure Statement	Uploaded on PRBDB website by the way of QPR & the Audited Financial Statements of PSRSP for 2012-13.
<b>Safeguards</b>	R & R Policy translated in Punjabi and Hindi	Uploaded on PRBDB website and World Bank's infoshop, kept in DC's Office, Gram Panchayat Offices, PWD field divisions and distributed among PAPs.
	Corridor specific RAPs.	Information for Phase I uploaded on PRBDB website and World Bank's infoshop, kept in DC's Office, State & District Libraries, Block Development Office, Tehsil & Panchayat office and PWD field divisions. For OPRC, draft RAP has already been uploaded on PRBDB website.
	Information regarding impacts and entitlements	For Phase I, uploaded on PRBDB website. List of PAPs with impacts and entitlements pasted in the village panchayat offices and also at public info kiosks at sites. For OPRC, the extent of loss for determination of impacts and entitlements is being prepared by OPRC contractor and the same shall be uploaded after finalization.
	NGO's monthly progress report. This report should contain. Extent of land and other immovable properties acquired. ID cards distributed to number of PAPs. ID cards distributed to number of PAPs. Number of joint accounts opened. Compensation disbursed to number of title holder PAPs. Assistance disbursed to number of titleholder and non-titleholder PAPs. Training imparted to number of PAPs for income restoration. Number of cases registered with Grievance Redressal Committee and cases redressed. Number of awareness generation camps held for HIV/AIDS and road	For Phase-1, all reports stand uploaded on PRBDB website pertaining to Implementation and Evaluation of RAP and awareness generation on HIV/AIDS.  For OPRC, the monitoring and evaluation of RAP and provisions relating to HIV/AIDS, is being done by OPRC Contractor, PRBDB.

	safety.	
	Disclosures of grievance redress process	Grievance Redressal Process forms a part of the R&R Policy and thus stands disclosed.
	Advance intimation of planned consultation and details of consultation carried out (listing of date/venue/participants in generic name e.g. panchayat representatives, photographs, and brief summary of suggestions accepted/adopted.)	Is being intimated to the PAPs before consultation. Disclosed in Public Information Kiosks, Field PWD divisions, to individuals and Panchayats and disclosed in PRBDB website also.
<b>Environment Management</b>	EA Summary	Uploaded on PRBDB website and World Bank's info-shop, kept in State & District Libraries, Construction sites/campus, PWD field divisions and information kiosks. Completed for Phase I roads. Under process for Phase II (OPRC) roads.
	Environment Screening & Scoping Report.	
	Corridor specific EMPs	
	Quarterly Status Report	Through Quarterly Progress Report, uploaded on PRBDB website.
<b>Engineering</b>	List of roads proposed to be undertaken clearly indicating start and end points of the contract.	Uploaded on PRBDB website and available with PWD field divisions.
	Proposed works/treatment giving details of widening, bypasses, junction improvement, drainage, traffic safety feature including proposed cross section and strip plan depicting major features etc.	Available in Public Information Kiosks
	Physical and Financial progress of each contract to be updated quarterly.	Uploaded on PRBDB website by the way of QPRs. However this is not being printed in any print media.
	Contract details of the concerned division, PRBDB, contractors and consultants.	Uploaded on PRBDB website and displayed on the display boards at the sites.
	Construction program with milestones and completion dates	Being submitted by the Contractor and relevant information being put in the information kiosks at work sites.
<b>Institutional Development Strategy</b>	Long Term Strategy for Road Sector by MTR	Final Report uploaded on the website.
	RMF Report	This covenant has been dropped in the project restructuring.
	State of the network report	Draft Final Report uploaded on the PRBDB website
	User satisfaction surveys	Final Report uploaded on the PRBDB website
	Project outcome & output indicators.	Draft Final Report uploaded on the PRBDB website

**Action Plan to Increase Oversight**

Transparency/ Disclosure Aspect	Action to be taken	Status
To facilitate CSO	Oversight, of procurement process and the implementation, shall be encouraged and facilitated, by inviting independent observers from local universities or other independent institutions.	Attempted but not succeeded fully due to poor response from educational institutes.
	The project will pilot use of CSO during the construction of roads.	The Civil Society participation is achieved through feedback on Toll Free number on OPRC road network .